Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia: Technical Assistance Evaluation Report

This technical assistance evaluation report on the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia was prepared by a staff team of the International Monetary Fund. It is based on the information available at the time it was completed on March 22, 2013. The views expressed in this document are those of the staff team and do not necessarily reflect the views of the government of the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia or the Executive Board of the IMF.

The policy of publication of staff reports and other documents by the IMF allows for the deletion of market-sensitive information.

**International Monetary Fund
Washington, D.C.**

INTERNATIONAL MONETARY FUND

Statistics Department

FORMER YUGOSLAV REPUBLIC OF MACEDONIA

REPORT ON THE STATISTICS TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE AND TRAINING EVALUATION MISSION
(September 26 to October 2, 2012)

Prepared by Wipada Soonthornsima and Kenneth Egesa

March 22, 2013

Contents   **Page**

ACRONYMS

BOP	Balance of Payments
BPM6	*Balance of Payments Manual* (*Sixth Edition*)
CPI	Consumer Price Index
DAC	Development Assistance Committee, OECD
DQAF	Data Quality Assessment Framework
ESA	European System of National and Regional Accounts
ESS	External Sector Statistics
EU	European Union
EUR	European Department, IMF
FYRM	Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia
GDDS	General Data Dissemination System
GFS	Government Finance Statistics
GFSM 2001	*Government Finance Statistics Manual 2001*
ICD	Institute for Capacity Development, IMF
IEO	Independent Evaluation Office, IMF
IFS	*International Financial Statistics*
IIP	International Investment Position
IPA	Instrument for Pre-Accession
ITRS	International transactions reporting system
MFS	Monetary and Financial Statistics
MFSM 2000	*Monetary and Finance Statistics Manual 2000*
MOF	Ministry of finance
NACE	Nomenclature des Activités Économiques dans la Communauté Européenne
NBRM	National Bank of the Republic of Macedonia
ODC	Other Depository Corporations
OECD	Organization of Economic Co-operation and Development
OFC	Other Financial Corporations
PPI	Producer Price Index
RBM	Result Based Management
ROSC	Report on the Observance of Standards and Codes
SDDS	Special Data Dissemination Standard
SITC	Standard International Trade Classification
2008 SNA	*System of National Accounts 2008*
SRF	Standardized Report Form
SSO	State Statistical Office
STA	Statistics Department, IMF
TA	Technical Assistance
TAIMS	Technical Assistance Information Management System

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- A mission from the IMF Statistics Department (STA) visited Skopje, Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia (FYRM) during September 26–October 2, 2012. The main purpose of the mission and activities before and after the mission was to evaluate the results that have been achieved in FYRM as a consequence of the technical assistance (TA) and training in the compilation and dissemination of macroeconomic statistics since 2000. The lessons learned from the mission are to be used to further enhance the effectiveness of STA TA and training.

- The mission worked closely with officials in each of the compiling agencies (the State Statistical Office (SSO), the National Bank of the Republic of Macedonia (NBRM), and the Ministry of Finance (MOF)). The authorities expressed their appreciation of the evaluation exercise, especially with regard to how it could enhance the effectiveness of their own capacity building effort.

Purpose

- The mission aimed: (i) to elicit the views of the authorities and other stakeholders (Appendix I) on the effectiveness of TA and training provided by STA and how these could be improved; and (ii) to discuss TA and training priorities with the authorities for the period ahead.

Scope

- The scope of the evaluation covered all STA TA and training provided to FYRM since 2000. During this time, STA delivered the following missions: 11 national accounts (NA) statistics missions, five balance of payments (BOP) statistics missions, four government finance statistics (GFS) missions, one price statistics mission, and one monetary and financial statistics (MFS) mission. It also conducted one Data Module Report on the Observance of Standards and Codes (ROSC) and one Special Data Dissemination Standard (SDDS) assessment mission as part of surveillance. Training has been provided to 53 Macedonian staff in macroeconomic statistics.

Methods used

- The method for the evaluation comprised of: (i) reviewing TA-related Fund documents, TA reports and training provided by STA since 2000; (ii) summarizing the findings of those missions and deriving the results obtained by the Macedonian authorities with the support of TA and training; (iii) eliciting the authorities' views on the effectiveness of STA's TA and training, and discussing the status of implementation of major recommendations made by STA missions, as well as the modes of TA and training delivery they considered most appropriate; (iv) soliciting views from national users of statistics, including interviews with TA donors and other stakeholders; (v) conducting a survey using two questionnaires—one for key TA beneficiaries and one for key data users—on the

usefulness of TA and training programs and observed changes in data quality since 2000; and (vi) consulting with the IMF's European Department (EUR) on the usefulness and effectiveness of STA TA and training on macroeconomic statistics for surveillance purposes.

Findings

- Overall, the authorities indicated that TA and training had been very useful in improving their statistical systems and statistics. The approach to provide subject specific TA following the Data Module ROSC was effective as the ROSC assessment was helpful in setting the context for future TA. Further, the Data Module ROSC had provided a comprehensive assessment beyond statistical methodology, which they found useful for institutional development.

- STA TA contributed to tangible progress in the FYRM statistical system. FYRM graduated from the General Data Dissemination System (GDDS) to SDDS in November 2011. In addition to improvements in methodological aspects of statistical quality, new data sets and more detailed data series are now disseminated compared to the early-2000s. Implementation of STA mission's recommendations was made in all subject areas, but at a different pace. However, shortage of staff resources and staff turnover delayed the implementation in some areas, especially in GFS.

- The authorities emphasized the usefulness of training. They noted that despite the slow pace of implementation of TA missions' recommendations in some cases, training had contributed to their understanding of international standards. It had also helped them to implement actions to bring data reporting into compliance with EU's requirements.

- Some agencies indicated that they paid attention to ensuring that TA programs were consistent among donors—especially with the European Union (EU) programs such as the Instrument for Pre-Accession (IPA). Nevertheless, STA could usefully collaborate more closely with other donors in implementing statistical programs.

- The mission also found that the quality of the TA reports, backstopping, and management report was generally adequate and had improved over time.

- The authorities indicated that TA is especially effective when TA providers have a good understanding of regional issues. Moreover, this was also considered useful in helping the authorities to fulfill EU's requirements. They stressed the need to provide continuous advice after the completion of missions, to better facilitate the implementation of mission recommendations.

- In some cases, because of staff resource shortages, STA TA could usefully help in setting the priorities of recommendations taking into account realistic available resources.

- STA TA could also involve the agency's top management in setting the priorities of recommendations to ensure the resource availability and the consistency with the agency's overall strategy.

- Overall, the modality of short-term missions was deemed appropriate considering STA's own resource constraint. However, in some cases where significant improvements of statistics had been made, the authorities requested for remote TA and training.

Conclusions and recommendations

TA should:

- Continue to first conduct a diagnostic mission and then develop a work program to provide TA and training support to meet the needs identified;

- Continue to tailor TA to the needs and priorities of the data compiling agencies and where possible, experts selected should have a good understanding of the country as well as of the region specific context for compiling statistics;

- Continue giving sufficient time to allow for progress in implementing recommendations between visits and also be flexible in some cases to sustain the momentum of TA work;

- Provide recommendations that are more realistic with available resources. In this context, involvement of the agency's top management in agreeing on clear priorities of recommendations could be useful;

- Enhance communication and collaboration among key stakeholders: the IMF (EUR and STA) and the authorities, country agencies (statistical compilers, source data agencies, key data users), the authorities and donors, and STA with other donors;

- Provide for subsequent regular communication between counterparts and experts to permit remote assistance between missions to ensure successful implementation of recommendations;

- Be mindful of other donor's efforts to assist the authorities to coordinate assistance optimally in terms of content, sequencing, timing; and

- Apply a results-based management (RBM) framework being adopted by the IMF to improve TA planning, implementation, and monitoring.

Training should:

- Focus on imparting skills relevant for the successful implementation of TA recommendations intended to improve the quality of statistics;

- Be more specific to the level of statistical developments of countries rather than using generic training formats. If not feasible, such training should be a part of TA on-the-job training;

- Where practicable, be conducted with the collaboration of other donors in the region;

- Be hands-on in addition to providing a sound understanding of the concepts and methodology; and

- Include sessions where countries share experiences on data compilation.

Future TA and training for FYRM

*For TA, priorities are***:**

- National accounts with a focus on improving GDP by expenditure;

- Price statistics—Consumer Price Index (CPI) and Producer Price Index (PPI);

- Monetary and financial statistics with focus on the compilation of the other financial corporations (OFC) survey and reconciliation of stocks and flows in monetary statistics;

- GFS and source data; and

- Remote TA to assist in further enhancing the external sector statistics.

*Training priorities are***:**

- *System of National Accounts 2008 (2008 SNA)/ the European System of National and Regional Accounts (ESA) 2010*

- *Monetary and Finance Statistics Manual 2000 (MFSM 2000)*

- *Balance of Payments Manual Sixth Edition (BPM6)*

- *Government Finance Statistics Manual, 2001* (*GFSM 2001*) with specific information on how *GFSM 2001* implementation could be consistent with *ESA 95* or ESA 2010 compliance.

I. INTRODUCTION

1.   As part of the technical assistance (TA) program of the IMF Statistics Department (STA) and in collaboration with the European Department (EUR), a STA mission visited Skopje, Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia (FYRM) during September 26–October 2, 2012. The main purpose of the mission and activities before and after the mission was to evaluate the results that have been achieved in FYRM as a consequence of the TA and training in the compilation and dissemination of macroeconomic statistics during the past decade. Specific objectives of the mission were to: (i) elicit the views of the authorities and other stakeholders on the effectiveness of TA and training provided by STA and discuss how it could be improved; and (ii) discuss TA and training priorities for the period ahead. The mission also discussed outstanding issues related to data reporting to the IMF. The mission overlapped with a real sector TA mission conducted by Mr. Segismundo Fassler, Regional Advisor of the project for "Capacity Building for Sustainable Compilation of Real Sector Statistics in Eastern Europe." [1]The inputs from Mr. Fassler, reflecting his knowledge of the region, contributed significantly to the work of this mission.

2.   To address these tasks, the mission worked closely with officials from the main data compiling and disseminating agencies, including especially: the State Statistical Office (SSO), the National Bank of the Republic of Macedonia (NBRM), and the Ministry of Finance (MOF). The mission also met with key users of Macedonia's macroeconomic statistics both from the public and private sectors.

3.   As part of the mission's preparations and to facilitate these discussions with the authorities and private sector data users, the mission distributed questionnaires and collected responses via the IMF's Resident Representative's office in Skopje, prior to the arrival of the mission (see Appendices IV to VIII). Two separate questionnaires were distributed to key TA beneficiaries and data users.

4.   The mission would like to express its appreciation to the Macedonian authorities for their cooperation and assistance, as well as for the excellent hospitality extended to the mission. The cooperation and dedication of the mission's counterparts greatly facilitated the mission's work. The mission also received excellent support from Mr. Alexander Tieman, the Resident Representative, and his team.

5.   Section II of the report provides a background to the evaluation and its scope. Section III outlines the findings and discusses the results that have been achieved with the support of TA and training provided by the IMF to FYRM in the four main areas of macroeconomic statistics. Section IV summarizes the views of the authorities that are the main beneficiaries of TA and training, the data users, and the EUR country team based on the questionnaires and interviews. Section V synthesizes lessons learned from the evaluation. Section VI presents the newly

---

[1] This project is financed by the government of Japan under the Japanese Special Account where Mr. Fassler is responsible for technical assistance in the real sector for Bosnia, Serbia, and Macedonia. His assignment is from June 2012 to June 2014.

introduced results based management (RBM) approach to technical assistance. Lastly, Section VII reviews the outcome of discussions on data reporting to STA.

II. BACKGROUND

A. Evaluation of STA TA and Training

6.   The evaluation of STA's technical assistance and training is increasingly founded on the Organization of Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) Development Assistance Committee (DAC) Principles for Evaluation of Development Assistance.[2] These principles state:

> "An evaluation is an assessment, as systematic and objective as possible, of an on-going or completed project, program or policy, its design, implementation and results. The aim is to determine the relevance and fulfillment of objectives, developmental efficiency, effectiveness, impact, and sustainability. An evaluation should provide information that is credible and useful, enabling the incorporation of lessons learned into the decision-making process of both recipients and donors." (Paragraph 5)

> "An important purpose of evaluation is to bring to the attention of policymakers constraints on developmental aid success resulting from policy shortcomings or rigidities both on the donor and recipient side, inadequate co-ordination, and the effectiveness of other practices…" (Paragraph 9)

> "Evaluations should contain an executive summary, a profile of its purpose and scope (including the activities to be evaluated), a description of the methods used, the main findings, lessons learned, and conclusions and recommendations. Evaluations need to look at agency procedures and management issues."

B. Background to the Evaluation of TA and Training to FYRM

7.   The TA evaluation mission to FYRM followed the recommendations in the IMF's Independent Evaluation Office (IEO) report in 2005 for developing more systematic approaches to track progress on major TA activities and to identify factors behind successes and shortfalls.[3] STA conducts evaluation exercise of its TA and training, including evaluation missions to a few countries that receive relatively high TA volume from STA. The evaluation exercise therefore aimed at systematically drawing out lessons learned from the evaluation with a view to enhancing TA and training. These lessons are expected to provide a more informed background for future collaboration.

---

[2] The DAC Principles for Evaluation of Development Assistance (1991 and reprinted in 2008) can be found here: http://www.oecd.org/dataoecd/31/12/2755284.pdf.

[3] The IEO report is available on the IMF's website: https://www.imf.org/External/np/ieo/2005/ta/eng/013105.htm.

8.   To the extent possible, the TA evaluation took into consideration the evolving work in the IMF to develop a RBM framework.[4] While none of the TA under review was formally formulated using this framework, the evaluation placed emphasis on the results that have been achieved with the TA and training support of the IMF in macroeconomic statistics during the period under review (2000–2012). Table 1 (in the next section) lists the TA and related missions under review. Appendices II and III describe training provided by the IMF to FYRM on macroeconomic statistics.

9.   To conduct the evaluation, the mission: (i) reviewed the TA-related Fund documents and TA reports as well as training provided by STA since 2000; (ii) summarized the findings of those TA missions and derived the results obtained by the Macedonian authorities with the support of these TA and training: (iii) elicited the authorities' views on the effectiveness of STA's TA and training, and discussed the status of implementation of major recommendations made by STA, as well as the modes of TA and training delivery they considered most appropriate; (iv) solicited views from national users of statistics; and (v) consulted with EUR and used EUR documents (especially the Statistical Issues Appendix to the latest Article IV staff report, 2011) to collect EUR views on the usefulness and effectiveness of STA TA and training on macroeconomic statistics to FYRM.

10.   To get the authorities' and national key data users' views on the effectiveness of TA, the mission provided each of the main data-compiling and disseminating agencies, and selected data users, with questionnaires on the usefulness of, and main lessons learned from, STA's TA and training with a focus on results. Two sets of questionnaires were used—one for key TA beneficiaries and one for key data users. The questionnaires also asked about future TA and training needs. The questionnaires were sent to (i) 11 TA recipients of whom 8 responded, representing 73 percent response rate, and (ii) 60 key data users of which 18 responded, representing 30 percent response rate. The summary of the results of the surveys was made prior to the mission so as to facilitate deeper evaluation during the mission. The questionnaires and a summary of the responses appear in Appendices IV–VIII.

11.   This evaluation report summarizes the findings, lessons, and recommendations regarding the TA and training with respect to: (i) relevance and effectiveness (including alignment with government priorities); (ii) efficiency (including coordination across government agencies and with donors); and (iii) impact and sustainability (including constraints on absorptive capacity). By nature, the assessments relied heavily on qualitative analysis, based on the views of stakeholders gathered through the process described above and to the extent possible substantiated by tangible evidence. In addition, the evaluation includes an assessment of the quality of the TA reports, backstopping, and management report.

12.   It is important to keep in mind that TA for statistical capacity building normally has a long time lag in producing results hence the benefit of TA might not be totally captured within the

---

[4] The IMF has been developing its Results Based Management framework since 2010 and is in the early stages of implementing that framework. An update on the Fund's Technical Assistance Evaluation Program can be reviewed at: http://www.imf.org/external/np/pp/eng/2010/061010.pdf.

review period. However to the extent feasible, the mission attempted to capture as comprehensively as possible, the contributions of the STA TA and training program to the improvement of macroeconomic statistics in FYRM. More importantly, the mission focused on the view of the authorities regarding the effectiveness of STA's TA and training program vis-à-vis their objectives as well as on what further improvements could be made.

III. TA AND TRAINING PROVIDED BY STA AND RELATED RESULTS

13.   FYRM has benefited from significant STA TA and training to assist the authorities to improve their statistics. Since 2000, STA delivered the following missions: one Data Module ROSC, eleven national accounts missions, five balance of payments statistics missions, four GFS missions, one price statistics mission, and one MFS mission. A Data Module ROSC was conducted in 2004, which is not technically a TA mission, but contained diagnostic information as well as recommendations to improve many aspects of data quality beyond the methodological aspect. STA also conducted a SDDS assessment mission to assist the authorities to make improvements in meeting the international standard for data dissemination. The delivery of TA has been through short-term missions both from the IMF Headquarter and from long-term regional projects financed by donors.

Table 1. List of Technical Assistance Missions to FYRM Conducted by the IMF Statistics Department between 2000 and 2012

Year	Topic
2000	Balance of Payment Statistics
2002	Balance of Payment Statistics
2004	National Accounts Statistics
2004	National Accounts Statistics
2004	Data Module ROSC
2005	Balance of Payment Statistics
2005	Money and Banking Statistics
2005	National Accounts Statistics
2006	Balance of Payment Statistics
2006	Government Finance Statistics

Year	Topic
2007	Government Finance Statistics, regional project
2007	National Accounts Statistics
2007	Export/Import Price Index
2007	Training: Government Finance Statistics
2008	Government Finance Statistics, regional project
2008	National Accounts Statistics
2008	National Accounts Statistics
2008	National Accounts Statistics
2008	National Accounts Statistics
2008	Balance of Payment Statistics
2009	Government Finance Statistics, regional project
2009	National Accounts Statistics
2010	SDDS Assessment
2011	Quarterly National Accounts
2012	Quarterly National Accounts, regional project

14.   In addition, during the last decade, 53 officials have attended IMF training courses, at headquarters and in regional training centers, in macroeconomic statistics. The core statistical subjects of STA comprise national accounts, price, government finance, monetary and financial, and external sector statistics. (See Appendices II and III on training provided.)

15.   The mission also found that the quality of the TA reports, backstopping, and management reports were generally adequate and have improved over time. Most of the documents related to the TA provided by STA were found without difficulty via the Technical Assistance Information Management System (TAIMS). STA relies on TAIMS to help manage the TA program, including contact information and TA reports. In general, the quality of the TA reports was deemed high, which in part could be due to the thorough backstopping and review processes in STA. While these review processes may have been expensive, the final product benefited from such time and

resource investments. This assessment was also mentioned by the authorities and they noted the quality improvement of TA reports overtime, especially in national accounts.

16.   The section that follows provides a summary of the findings of the 2004 Data Module ROSC mission, single-topic TA missions' findings and the implementation of their main recommendations, and the main results that were achieved with IMF support.

A. The 2004 Data Module ROSC

17.   The 2004 Data Module ROSC was conducted against the GDDS benchmark. The mission provided an in-depth assessment of the quality of the FYRM's macroeconomic statistics using the IMF's Data Quality Assessment Framework (DQAF). The data assessment covered the national accounts, consumer price index, producer price index, government finance, monetary and financial, and balance of payments statistics. The mission also conducted an institutional assessment of the main macroeconomic statistics compiling agencies: the NBRM, the SSO, and the MOF. More importantly, the ROSC mission provided prioritized recommendations.

18.   The ROSC mission found that although the SSO and the NBRM had a favorable legal and institutional environment that supported the compilation of statistics, the MOF had been only able to produce limited coverage of government finance statistics according to the international standard. At the time of the mission, the institutional arrangement of MOF allowed only the production of budgetary central government data on a timely basis but not the consolidated data for the general government in accordance with the framework of the *GFSM 2001*. All three institutions were found to be characterized by a high degree of professionalism and observance of ethical standards by their staff. The mission found that resources for the compilation of national accounts statistics were broadly sufficient, while the NBRM also allocated adequate resources for the compilation of the monetary and financial, and balance of payments statistics. However, it indicated that not enough resources were available for the compilation of GFS and price indices. There were procedures in place for the SSO and the NBRM for monitoring the relevance of the data produced but no processes for consultations with users in the case of fiscal data.

19.   For national accounts statistics, the lack of a statistical register and low response rate to surveys made the latter source data not suitable for compilation of national accounts. Hence, national accounts was mostly compiled based on data from financial statements of enterprises available from administrative databases. On technical issues, deficiencies were observed in deflation methods for the national accounts and the index formula for price indices (CPI and PPI). More specifically, statistical techniques for the compilation of volume measures of value added in some activities and for measuring taxes on products were found not adequate and no inventory valuation adjustments were made for the compilation of GDP by production and by expenditure. A methodological problem was found with regard to the application of the index formula that could potentially cause a bias in the price indices. The treatment of missing prices could also be improved. The mission recommended improving the response rate to surveys by invoking and implementing the tools given by State Statistics Act (1997). The mission also recommended that the authorities complete the statistical register, improve procedures for the compilation of volume

measures, implement inventory valuation adjustments, increase human resources for the compilation of price indices, revise the formula for CPI and PPI, include exports in PPI, and improve procedures for collecting the data from the household budget survey.

20.   Data Module ROSC also noted many areas for improvement in GFS to meet international standards, namely *GFSM 2001*. It found that MOF compiled fiscal statistics following national concepts and definitions, broadly similar to *GFSM 1986*, but there was no migration plan to *GFSM 2001*. Coverage was limited to budgetary central government despite some availability of source data. Domestic debt data for central government were not disseminated. The basis of recoding was on a cash basis rather than the recommended accrual basis. Improvements were needed to better align the national chart of accounts with *GFSM 2001* and an automated procedure for the assessment of source data was required. Data seemed to be consistent within the fiscal data set but was not always the case with monetary statistics.

21.   The mission found that the quality of the MFS was good and in most cases consistent with the framework for compiling monetary statistics as recommended in *the Monetary and Financial Statistics Manual 2000 (MFSM 2000)*. However, some improvements were needed with regard to: extending the scope of the depository corporations survey to include savings houses, better classification of some financial instruments such as shares and other equity and insurance technical reserves, following the correct basis for recording of non-tradable long-term securities issued by the Bank Rehabilitation Agency and reviewing the processes for assessing source data to ensure their effectiveness in identifying data inconsistencies and misclassifications. The mission recommended an expansion of the institutional coverage of monetary statistics to include savings houses and classification improvement of financial assets.

22.   For balance of payments statistics, the mission found that the overall quality of the statistics was good, except for some shortcomings. Important shortcomings were connected with scope in the case of reinvested earnings, basis for recording of interest which was recorded on a due-for-payment basis instead of accrual basis, and source data for private current transfers and unrecorded trade. The mission recommended close collaboration with the SSO to use surveys for better estimation of private transfers and incorporation of the results of supplementary surveys covering known data gaps, such as reinvested earnings, travel, and trade credit.

B.   TA Evaluation Mission Findings on Single-Topic Missions

23.   STA has provided intensive TA on national accounts statistics with 11 missions. Following the 2004 Data Module ROSC mission, a TA project focusing on the development of quarterly national accounts was initiated in May of the same year. Two follow-up missions on national accounts were carried out afterwards in October 2004 and August 2005 to assist in the implementation of the project. A new system of quarterly compilation of GDP by production, based on international best practices was established providing both estimates at current prices and estimates of volume measures consistent with the annual data. The system which is now operational was not implemented until late 2008 when the first quarterly estimates based on the expenditure approach also became available. Further recommendations were provided on development of quarterly GDP by expenditure and reconciliation between the quarterly estimates

by production and expenditure. To have good benchmarks for quarterly data, STA also provided recommendations to improve the annual accounts. However, these recommendations were implemented at a rather slow pace. These included improving the methodology for the calculation of volume measures of annual GDP and improving the accuracy of annual GDP current price data.

24.   A mission on **price statistics** was carried out in December 2007. Its main purposes were to assist the authorities to improve the unit value indices of exports and imports, and to develop the methodology for establishing price indices of exports and imports based on price specifications. The mission also reviewed the status of implementation of previous recommendations on the CPI and PPI and found that they had not been implemented (the procedures for imputing missing prices for seasonal products was not introduced, no data had been collected for the imputed rents of owner-occupied dwellings, and exports had not been included in the scope of the PPI). However, it found that important projects were ongoing for the updating of both indices with new weight base and reference periods. Moreover, the SSO was engaged in developing the harmonized CPI in accordance with EU regulations.

25.   Following the 2004 Data Module ROSC, STA provided four **GFS** TA missions to assist the authorities to improve the fiscal statistics. The TA was primarily aimed at ensuring that the GFS meet the *GFSM 2001* standards which could also advance compilation efforts as per the *1995 European System of Accounts* (ESA 95). STA selected FYRM as one of the pilot countries to present the fiscal statistics in the *GFSM 2001* format in the context of IMF Surveillance work and in EUR Staff Reports, following the IMF Board's directive. For this purpose, the 2006 GFS mission reviewed the fiscal source data and MOF Treasury's data compilation practices against the *GFSM 1986* framework with a view to developing an automatic bridge table linking the data into *GFSM 2001* framework. The mission found some data gaps, especially related to source data for the development of the balance sheet. Follow-up missions attempted to develop a bridge table to the extent possible and provided hands-on training. By the last GFS mission in 2009, the *GFSM 2001* format data were produced for 2005–2007. MOF reported GFS in the *GFSM 2001* format to STA for the first time in 2009. Unfortunately the two staff who were counterparts of the GFS missions both left the MOF. Very limited staff in the Treasury's Statistics Division (two people) combined with other work priorities explained the limited implementation of the GFS missions' recommendations. The MOF no longer reports data to STA. Nevertheless as compared with the situation in 2000, the MOF has disseminated more fiscal data (broadly consistent with *GFSM1986*), higher frequency data (monthly data for central government operations), and started to disseminate general government operations data on an annual basis. Also, since last year, central government debt data (both stocks of external and domestic debt) have been disseminated on the MOF's website. In connection with the subscription to the SDDS, tangible improvements have been achieved in GFS both in terms of methodological and dissemination aspects.

26.   On **MFS**, STA fielded one TA mission to the NBRM in 2005. The mission was instrumental in assisting the NBRM to commence compilation of the full set of sectoral balance sheets and surveys of the depository corporations. The mission also provided assistance on

addressing classification issues of more disaggregated loans, treatment of treasury bills and NBRM reserves used for guarantees, data revision practices, and consistency of monetary data with other macroeconomic statistics. The mission also assisted the authorities to implement the Standardized Report Forms (SRFs) for reporting monetary data to STA. All of the recommendations of the mission have been implemented although with some time lag. The MFS currently compiled and disseminated are of good quality and follow the recommendations in the *MFSM 2000*.

27.   For **BOP statistics**, STA conducted four TA missions during 2000 and 2006. The missions helped improve the international transactions reporting system (ITRS) especially in its redesign to include data validation and consistency checks as it was the main data source for the compilation of external sector statistics. Subsequent TA missions helped with the expansion of data sources to include direct reporting in form of surveys of direct investment, trade credit, travel, and current transfers. These missions reviewed the possibility of using partner country data in the case of trade in part to address the shortcomings of the ITRS system and also took into account new developments in the economy. The TA also promoted better collaboration among different data collection agencies for related external sector statistics (NBRM, MOF, and SSO) to ensure consistency between the different macroeconomic statistics and avoid duplication of efforts. Assistance on reconciliation between flow data (including transactions of the BOP) and stock data for items reported in the international investment positions statement was provided. The authorities made very good use of TA in terms of the progress made in implementing the recommendations of the TA missions. Implementation of a few remaining recommendations is still on-going particularly in respect of current transfers and travel estimates.

28.   With regard to **training**, the FYRM authorities indicated that they had benefited significantly from training offered at the IMF headquarters as well as training programs offered at the regional training center in Vienna and in the country. They received training in all macroeconomic statistics. The mission found that the authorities had made sufficient effort to secure training for key staff directly involved in the compilation and dissemination of macroeconomic statistics. It was noted that training of the key staff had yielded positive results in regard to improvements in the quality of statistics compiled. However, not unique to FYRM, in some instances trained staff moved to different areas and were replaced by new staff some of whom were yet to benefit from the different training programs provided by the IMF. Both theoretical and hands-on training were also delivered during the TA missions, especially following introduction of new data collection and compilations procedures. However, further training to cover new developments in compilation was highlighted by the authorities as a key requirement especially in view of the introduction of more recent guidelines and manuals for the compilation of macroeconomic statistics. Overall, the authorities indicated that training offered by the IMF was very beneficial especially owing to its practicality during the workshop sessions, the expertise of the trainers, and the opportunity accorded to participants to network and share experiences.

C. Results

29.   During the period 2000–2012, the Macedonian authorities have made noticeable progress towards strengthening their macroeconomic statistics (Table 2). Much of the progress was in terms of conforming to internationally accepted statistical methodologies for data compilation of macroeconomic statistics. In addition, there has been good progress in data dissemination practices, sensitization of users about revisions of data, as well as an increase in the volume of data releases. Furthermore, the authorities have made progress on the institutional and legal structure to enhance data compilation.

30.   In the area of **national accounts statistics** where most TA has been provided during the period 2004–2012, the SSO has made significant progress in improving the scope and quality of the national accounts. A tangible measure of this progress is the subscription to the SDDS. The support of the STA TA had a significant role in the development of a quarterly compilation system of GDP by production at current prices and in volume terms. STA TA has also assisted in improving the methodology for the compilation of the annual accounts, particularly the GDP estimates based on the production and the expenditure approaches. Revised annual series of volume measures of GDP have been compiled. However, further improvements are planned, particularly with regards to the estimates of changes in inventories. Also, the estimates of household consumption expenditure still need to be implemented.

31.   As recommended by the 2007 **price statistics** mission, the unit value of exports and imports are now compiled monthly using the Standard International Trade Classification (SITC). The indices have also been compiled using the international standard--NACE classification (Nomenclature des Activités Économiques dans la Communauté Européenne). Price-specific indices of exports and imports have not yet been introduced owing to the lack of staff resources, although work is planned to be initiated with the support of a European Union project (IPA 2009). Improvements to the CPI have been introduced in accordance with international standards and EU regulations concerning the treatment of seasonal products and the use of the geometric mean for the calculation of the elementary indices.

32.   The series of **GFS** missions developed a bridge table to automatically recast the fiscal data to the *GFSM 2001* framework and the data were produced for 2005–2007. Further, the coverage of fiscal statistics was extended to general government operations. MOF increased dissemination of fiscal data significantly, including the new data series for annual general government operations and stock of public debt. To meet the international standard for dissemination of statistics, the MOF has disseminated an advance release calendar since 2011. GFS training and TA to the MOF Statistics staff helped their understanding of the production of fiscal data in the ESA95 framework as well. However, the lack of staff resources has limited the sustainability of the TA in GFS.

33.   Impressive results have been achieved in the production of **external sector statistics** that meet international standards. The authorities are now compiling and disseminating important new

sets of external sector data, such as international investment position (IIP) data, reserve assets and foreign currency liquidity data, and external debt statistics. The compilation of reserves data meeting the IMF's "International Reserves and Foreign Currency Liquidity: Guidelines for a Data Template" (2001) was notably useful for policy decision makers. Other notable improvements during the period included the increased use of electronic data dissemination and improved timeliness as well as periodicity of data.

Table 2. Comparison of Macroeconomic Statistics 2000 and 2012[1]

Statistics	Coverage		Periodicity		Timeliness		Methodology	
	2000	2012	2000	2012	2000	2012	2000	2012
National accounts	National	National	A	Q	15M	80D	*1993 System of National Accounts/ European System of Accounts 1995 (1995 ESA).*	Added some elements *of the 2008 System of National Accounts/ European System of Accounts 2010*
Consumer price index	National	National	M	M	3D	3D	*Consumer Price Indices: An ILO Manual 1989*	Added some elements of the most updated methodology following EU regulations
Government finance statistics	Central Government General Government	Central Government General Government	M -	M A	Q -	Q 2Q	*A Manual on Government Finance Statistics 1986 (GFSM 1986)*	Progress has been made toward the *GFSM 2001* framework. Some GFS data were reported to STA.
Monetary and financial statistics	Banking sector	Banking sector	M	M	1M	21D	*A (Draft) Guide to Money and Banking Statistics in IFS 1984*	*Monetary and Financial Statistics Manual 2000*
Balance of payments	National	National	M	M	75D	2M	Broadly follow *Balance of Payments Statistics Manual, fifth edition (1993)*	More adherence to *Balance of Payments Statistics Manual, fifth edition (1993)*
International investment position	-	National	-	A	-	1Q	-	*Balance of Payments Statistics Manual, fifth edition (1993)*
Reserves template	National	National	M	M	45D	1M	*Balance of Payments Statistics Manual, fifth edition (1993)*	*International Reserves and Foreign Currency Liquidity : Guidelines for a Data Template (2001)*
External debt	Public Sector	National	Q	Q	25D	1Q	*National classification*	*External Debt Statistics Guide 2003*

---

[1] Notation "-" means 'not available".

34.   In summary, the main results that have been achieved in recent years, with the support of STA TA and training, include the following:

- FYRM graduated from being a GDDS participant to a subscriber of the SDDS in November 2011;

- Adoption of improved methodology for the compilation of the volume measure of GDP by production and expenditure;

- Development of a quarterly compilation system for GDP by production at current prices and in volume terms;

- Development of monthly unit values of exports and imports compiled using international standards (the SITC classification and NACE classification);

- Development of a bridge table to recast fiscal data into the GFSM 2001 framework, but some important data gaps remain to complete GFS balance sheets.

- Compilation of MFS based on the MFSM 2000, and reporting to STA using the IMF's SRFs for the central bank and other depository corporations (ODC);

- Collection of information for the compilation of the OFC survey to expand the coverage of monetary and financial statistics;

- Improved adherence to Balance of Payments Statistics Manual, fifth edition, for the compilation of balance of payments and IIP;

- Improved dissemination of quarterly BOP and IIP statistics, and strengthened data sources for the compilation of trade credits, foreign direct investment, loans and workers' remittances; and

- Improved inter-institutional collaboration across data producing agencies which has been facilitated through discussions of methodology among responsible institutions and formalization of data sharing and better sequencing of surveys. As a subscriber to the SDDS, statistical agencies collaborate closely to fulfill the data reporting requirements. Nevertheless, there is room for further collaboration to increase cross sectoral data consistency.

D. Summary of Findings

35.   STA TA and training has been relevant, in most cases, responding to demands expressed by the Macedonian authorities. The authorities confirmed that STA TA was reasonably effective especially in national accounts, BOP and MFS. For national accounts and prices, implementation of recommendations was delayed in some instances due to insufficient resources and difficulties faced in establishing adequate source data. Lack of staff resource has been the major reason for the delay in implementing the TA recommendations, especially for GFS.

36.   The TA interventions were efficient in large part due to STA's focus on the provision of assistance in the core areas of its technical expertise and STA's selection of appropriate experts. The authorities commended the efforts made by STA in the selection and use of experts with a good understanding of the local and regional setting and systems which facilitated the recommendation of appropriate tasks for improvement. Further, the continuation of the same TA experts has led to more efficiency in the delivery of TA. The provision of complimentary training to staff involved directly in the compilation of statistics enhanced the implementation of TA's recommendations and sustainability. Also, the authorities indicated that they found TA reports to be sufficiently clear and one agency noted that the quality of reports had improved over time. This reflects positively on the quality of STA back stopping practices, particularly in striving to produce clearly written TA reports.

37.   The TA had a strong and positive impact in most cases, as demonstrated by the results obtained by the authorities. Many constraints to capacity were overcome through additional recruitment and training of staff, in some cases. Examples of results included the implementation of changes in national accounts to increase periodicity to quarterly, expansion of the monetary and financial statistics to include savings houses, compilation and dissemination of the IIP, updated methodologies for GFS, BOP and MFS; and stronger inter-institutional collaboration such as an establishment of statistical committee with members from various agencies to ensure common strategy.

IV. VIEWS ON TA EFFECTIVENESS, EFFICIENCY, AND IMPACT AND SUSTAINABILITY

A. Official Data-Producing Agencies in FYRM

38.   The discussions with the main data-producing agencies, as well as the responses to the questionnaires sent prior to the mission, indicated that STA's TA has generally been effective. The authorities noted the key role played by the Data Module ROSC mission in terms of setting the agenda for key improvements to be made to the various statistics. In particular, the NBRM indicated that its reorganization of the statistics department benefited significantly from the concurrent undertaking of the Data Module ROSC mission. Overall, the recommendations from the TA missions conducted in BOP, national accounts and MFS had to a large extent been implemented. The authorities highlighted the lack of sufficient resources as key limitations faced in the implementation of TA recommendations, especially for GFS. Further, availability of source data was highlighted as the key factor explaining delays in implementing some recommendations. They also noted that the evaluation of TA effectiveness was useful because it allowed them to express their views regarding the STA TA and to reflect on how best to enhance their use of TA.

39.   The three main data-producing agencies (NBRM, SSO and MOF) indicated that the TA: (i) addressed issues that were highly relevant for the country and the objectives of the TA were developed, in most cases, with close consultation with the authorities of the counterpart agency which facilitated adequate absorption of the TA provided; (ii) provided practical hands-on assistance with actual data collection; (iii) contributed to the increase in the scope and quality of statistics; and (iv) increased awareness on the need for good data dissemination practices and contributed towards the implementation of recommended data dissemination practices.

40.   SSO and NBRM were appreciative of the sequencing and timing of TA which permitted gradual but tangible progress between different missions while other agencies held the view that some improvement to the sequencing could be done. Of particular note was the importance of the Data Module ROSC mission which was considered very timely and provided a comprehensive assessment of the status of statistical compilation and dissemination. The authorities found the ROSC report useful and they generated their work plans following the ROSC's recommendations. The NBRM adopted the DQAF approach for their own regular assessment of the statistics compiled and related procedures. They also valued the opportunities that TA missions provided to foster inter-agency communication and cooperation, which is a particular challenge in the case of the FYRM.

41.   As regards to resources, authorities noted that TA recommendations should be more consistent with available staff resources and should provide prioritized recommendations accordingly. One agency indicated that a rather general recommendation to increase staff resources so as to allow for more statistical improvement could create an unrealistic expectation from their staff despite the reality of the budget constraint. Instead, TA could be more helpful by identifying clearly the priorities under a realistic scenario for staff resources. In this connection, in some cases, STA TA could also involve and, if possible, get a clear agreement with the agency's top management in setting the priorities of recommendations to ensure of the availability of resources and the consistency of recommendations with the agency's overall strategy.

42.   Even in the cases where limited staff resources and source data delayed the implementation of TA's recommendations, TA still provided the important benefit of enhancing the authorities' understanding of international standards. Despite some delay in the GFS improvement, the authorities indicated the usefulness of GFS TA to enhance their understanding of *ESA95* compliance. In particular, the collaboration with the authorities when determining the TA and training objectives had been instrumental in avoiding overlaps with other TA and training providers.

43.   On modalities for delivering the TA, the compiling and disseminating agencies diverged in their preference possibly reflecting different stages of statistical development. The SSO preferred and continues to prefer short-term TA and training. The NBRM staff responsible for external sector statistics appreciated earlier TA in the form of short-term missions but expressed preference for future TA to be delivered remotely and the need for more training. With other higher priorities and limited staff resources, the MOF preferred training and indicated that IMF TA should be collaborated with other national agencies (like SSO) and international agencies (like Eurostat) in light of the ongoing work towards achieving ESA95 compilation standards. Such collaboration should ensure consistent recommendations and right sequences of TA.

44.   The data compiling agencies emphasized the important role played by experts after conducting the TA missions with regard to addressing follow-up questions through emails as an important ingredient for successful TA. Authorities highlighted the importance of continuity of TA through remote means after the missions. They also highlighted the importance of clearly written reports.

B. National Users of Statistics

45.   The responses to the questionnaires distributed by the mission and discussions with data users showed that users had observed significant improvements in the quantity and quality across all macroeconomic statistics during the last ten years. However, the users highlighted GFS as the area that required the most improvement. In general, the responses to the questionnaires highlighted the importance and effectiveness of TA and its relevance in influencing the improvements in statistics observed during the period. These perspectives were confirmed by the mission during interviews with users. Some interviewees further expressed their concerns about: (i) the limited availability of detailed data of good quality on employment, real estate prices, confidence indicators, disposable income, import and export price indices and living standards [5]; (ii) implementation of dissemination policy regarding equal access, with one response highlighting an incidence that a cabinet minter quote some SSO's statistics before they were publically released[6]; (iii) timeliness and comprehensiveness of GFS statistics; and (iv) accuracy of estimation of private transfers. Interviews with users also exposed a need for improvements to the SSO's web content and for an increase in the level of detail disseminated for GFS. Also, some key data users indicated that TA should pay more attention to agency collaboration, especially among source data agencies and MOF.

C. EUR

46.   This section on the views of the EUR-FYRM team reflects the information in the latest Staff Report of 2011 for FYRM and the discussion with the EUR team members. The 2011 Staff Report indicates that data provision has some shortcomings, but is broadly adequate for surveillance and monitoring purposes. EUR recognized the usefulness of STA TA and training and that there has been tangible progress in data availability and data quality during the last few years. It noted tangible contributions from TA on the quality improvements in balance of payments and national accounts statistics. Regarding national accounts statistics, data now included the quarterly GDP series by production and expenditure both at current and constant prices. The consistency of annual and quarterly national accounts data has improved. In this connection, EUR recognized that continuing and regular engagement (preferably by the same TA person/team) has paid off over time.

47.   EUR also indicated that the focus of TA should be extended beyond methodology to other aspects of data quality such as dissemination format and improvement of source data. High

---

[5] It should be noted that STA does not provide TA in the area of labor market statistics, real estate prices, confidence indicators, and living standards.

[6] In response to one comment on transparency of data dissemination, SSO indicated the positive objective assessment in the "Light Peer Review on the Implementation of European Statistics Code of Practice in the Republic of Macedonia", November 2010. The report was sponsored by the EU's project "Global assessments of statistical systems of candidate and potential candidate countries as well as ENP countries". The report indicated that "All users have equal access to statistical releases at the same time. Privileged pre-release access is not granted under any circumstances. From the discussions with users during the Peer Review it appears that this approach is generally accepted and that there is no pressure on the SSO to provide privileged access." Also, the SSO's own user survey covering 310 respondents rated the quality of the SSO's website at 3.71-3.79 out of possible 5 points. See the report at http://www.stat.gov.mk/ .

priorities should be in the areas of national accounts statistics, fiscal data (based on the FYRM's budget law on coverage and classification) and GFS as well as labor market statistics. It was noted that national accounts statistics, at times, had large revisions that could benefit from clearer explanation of the revisions. While EUR noted improvement in the data dissemination practices partly the result of FYRM's subscription to SDDS and more downloadable data, further improvement could be made with TA support. The SSO's publication could benefit from the inclusion of data status (preliminary, revised, or final data) and more comprehensive metadata. The reconciliation of GDP based on expenditure and production approaches also requires further improvement.

48.   TA should give more focus on source data, especially fiscal data, so better GFS could be produced. Data coverage of government below-the-line financing from NBRM was inadequate, as a result of different coverage of accounts between the MOF and the NBRM.

V. LESSONS SYNTHESIZED FROM THE EXPERIENCE IN FYRM

A primary objective for this report is to help STA assess the effectiveness of its TA and training program so as to explore areas for improvement. The findings are consistent with those of the TA evaluation on Peru. The mission synthesized the following lessons from the TA and training experiences with FYRM during 2000–2012.[7] In general, there was consensus among data compilers and users that the IMF TA and training interventions were effective and had contributed to improved macroeconomic statistics in the FYRM over the course of the last twelve years.

- The TA was effective in the FYRM, in part, because it was well tailored to the needs and priorities of the data compiling agencies. The authorities indicated that using experts with a good understanding of the country and region specific context besides their technical competence strengthened TA effectiveness and helped fulfill a statistical agency's overall strategy.

- The diagnostic or assessment missions, such as the Data Module ROSC (which assessed various aspects of data quality beyond methodology) and the SDDS assessment missions provided useful benchmarks for pursuing a well guided action plan for improvements to the statistics as well as more focused TA and training.

- Well spread timing of TA missions contributed to effective TA. In FYRM, TA missions appeared sufficiently spread over time to allow for progress in implementing recommendations between TA visits. The practice to agree on a minimum achievement in the implementation of recommendations before the follow-up mission had been useful in balancing the progress made and timely follow-up, but some flexibility should be considered to keep the momentum of statistical improvement. A short visit or remote TA should be considered when the authorities find technical challenges in implementing recommendations.

---

[7] The findings are consistent of those of the TA evaluation on Peru. See "Peru: Report on the Statistics Technical Assistance and Training Evaluation Mission (December 12–16, 2011)".

- A closer "remote" follow-up after the mission is helpful to ensure the momentum of implementation of TA's recommendations. The experience of FYRM underscores the importance of close contact between the experts who provide TA and their counterparts in the compiling agencies. Over the course of implementation of the recommendations, there are new developments as well as challenges that occur which can affect the outcome of the respective recommendations. The ability of the counterparts to regularly contact the TA experts and to receive quick response to their questions and requests for clarification and further assistance enhanced the effectiveness of TA and also helped to identify areas where further TA could focus during subsequent missions.

- Staff constraints and staff turn-over limit the TA results and TA should make prioritized recommendations that are more appropriate to the resource availability. Going beyond discussions with technical counterparts, seeking an agreement from the agency's top management on resource commitment and prioritized recommendations could enhance TA effectiveness, especially when the agency face a serious budget and staff constraint.

- TA missions could play a more active role by discussing with the management of the counterpart agency to help improve staff capacity and resources. In light of no budget increase prospect in the near term for some agencies, the TA missions could encourage authorities to explore obtaining financial resources for training and other inputs such as IT components from other donors to help improve staff productivity.

- Moreover, enhancing collaboration across agencies and with other donors could help leverage the output of limited staff, for example, by eliminating repetitive tasks among agencies and improving sequencing of statistical programs across agencies. Communication among various stakeholders played an important role to enhance TA effectiveness and TA missions could assist their counterparts in communication more broadly. These issues pertain to communication between: the IMF (both EUR and STA) and the authorities; among FYRM agencies; among the authorities and donors; and STA with other donors.

- In the context of surveillance, the authorities and the area department team can usefully identify important shortcomings of statistics necessary for policy decisions. Such information helps set the stage for TA priorities for statistical agencies and STA.

- The area department could play an important catalyst role to enhance the TA effectiveness. Normally with more visits to a country or with a Resident Representative, the area department could help follow-up on the progress on implementation of TA's recommendations as well as help leverage the relevant information to policy decision makers—key data users. Given their access to top management of statistical agencies, the area department could help encourage the pace of implementation of TA's recommendations and in turn support solutions to constraints faced by the agencies.

- TA should assist more on strengthening inter-agency collaboration and cooperation because, often times, TA experts work with more than just the counterpart agency and could bring relevant officials from various agencies together to address statistical issues. While FYRM already institutionalizes inter-agency collaboration at many different levels, the TA could still provide some additional stimulation. Further, where TA identified duplicity of data compilation roles across different agencies, and provided an assessment of

the quality of the data compiled by the different agencies, collaboration could result in the rationalization of resources e.g. in the case of merchandise and services trade and foreign investment. The exploitation of better collaboration among compiling agencies could result in the reduction of duplication of efforts and improvement in the quality of statistics; however, it is important to stress that such collaboration does not always lead to more timely data as different institutions do not always have the same amount of resource availability.

- On the modality, the FYRM authorities indicated that the application of a mix of TA and training interventions was applied reasonably and appropriately, but a more flexible approach could be useful. Short-term TA missions followed the Data Module ROSC and SDDS missions work well to address key areas needed improvements identified by ROSC/SDDS missions. In addition, these TA missions were also complemented by training of officials through courses offered locally, regionally, and at the IMF headquarters. Nevertheless, there is room for more remote TA to allow for more timely and more frequent assistance as needed, especially when the level of statistical development of the FYRM counterparts is sufficiently high and there is no need for a mission.

- TA should assist more actively in the collaboration with other donors to ensure consistency of various statistical development programs in terms of content, sequencing, and timing. In addition, such collaboration could lead to donors providing supplementary statistical development programs that are outside STA's core areas, e.g. a donor assists in an expansion of source data to allow STA TA to improve compilation of national accounts statistics. Collaboration should also enhance the consistency of recommendations and priorities among donors' TA programs, especially in light of limited local resources.

- TA plays an important role in helping the authorities to adopt internationally accepted statistical methodologies for improved international data comparability, and data dissemination standards. The TA missions facilitated the process of improving data quality as well as a continuous assessment of the progress made during the period. Further, the TA also facilitated the creation of awareness on the priority areas for improving statistics and training. The TA also helped to provide an objective and independent assessment of the quality of statistics which is important for building credibility of the statistics among data users.

- TA development and monitoring could be enhanced using the newly introduced 'Results-Based Management' (RBM) approach as described in the next section.

- The training of staff directly involved with the compilation during TA missions was highlighted as one of the important factors contributing to the effectiveness of TA. The FYRM authorities indicated that they were mindful to select staff for training who could make immediate contributions after the training. In most instances, such training, which is hands-on and practical, concentrated on imparting skills relevant for the successful implementation of TA recommendations.

- Regardless of the pace of progress in TA, training contributes importantly to capacity building in countries. Despite the slow pace of implementation of TA missions'

recommendations in some cases, training had contributed to the understanding of international standards. For FYRM, regardless of the progress of implementation of the IMF TA's recommendations, training had helped them bring data reporting into compliance with EU's requirements.

- However, training should be tailored to the level of statistical development in a country to have immediate impact. Training should give more emphasis on sessions where countries share experiences on data compilation. Collaboration among donors and institutions on training is also important.

VI. RESULTS-BASED MANAGEMENT FRAMEWORK

49. Recently the Fund has adopted an RBM framework to enhance the effectiveness of TA planning, implementation, and monitoring that could usefully be applicable for TA to FYRM. An RBM framework contains objectives, outcomes, indicators, milestones, and risk assessments and assumptions that clearly identify targeted results, with **S**pecific, **M**easurable, **A**ttainable, **R**elevant, and **T**ime-bound ("SMART") characteristics.[8] While the information available through briefing papers, TA reports and notes, back-to-office reports, and the administrative system contain useful information, the current framework does not explicitly contain all the elements of a full RBM framework in a consistent manner. Nevertheless, it is important to note that even prior to the RBM, STA TA operations have already incorporated many elements of RBM, such as setting clear project framework summary. Hence, this assessment mission used broadly the RBM principles to the extent possible.

50. Going forward, using an RBM framework should enhance the effectiveness of TA planning and delivery. In applying the RBM, the IMF should invest in the effort to raise the understanding of TA recipient countries on the RBM framework and its potential benefit to enhance the implementation of the framework.

VII. DATA REPORTING TO STA

51. The mission also discussed with the authorities the issues regarding data reporting to STA for the IMF statistical publications. Overall FYRM authorities report data regularly and there is no reporting issue, except for GFS for the IMF statistical publications. The mission encouraged the MOF to resume reporting the annual GFS data that was initiated in 2009 but fully recognized the resource constraints of the MOF. It also recognizes that the MOF already posts significant fiscal data on its website. Contact information in each agency was updated or confirmed. The mission stressed the advisability of reporting preliminary data followed by revisions, instead of delaying reporting until final data become available.

---

[8] The Fund has just begun to implement an RBM framework for TA Fund-wide. The full benefits of the roll-out of this RBM framework will likely be reflected in future TA evaluations, but only in the medium term. STA has recently begun to incorporate "benchmark actions," which are similar to milestones, in its TA work.

Appendix I. List of Officials and Data Users Interviewed by the Mission in FYRM

National Bank of the Republic of Macedonia

Mr. Dimitar Bogov, Governor
Ms. Anita Angelovska Bezoska, Vice Governor
Ms. Maja Kadievska Vojnovik, Vice Governor
Ms. Maja Andreevska, Director, Statistics Department
Ms. Ana Mitreska, Director, Research Department
Ms. Liljana Torova, Deputy Director, Statistics Department
Ms. Sultanija Bojceva Terzijan, Deputy Director, Research Department
Ms. Biljana Davidovska-Stojanova, Head, Real Sector Development Division, Research Department
Mr. Igor Velickovski, Deputy Manager, Operations and Foreign Reserves Department
Ms. Tanja Efremova, Head of Division, Statistics Department
Ms. Vesna Hristovska, Manager, Operations and Foreign Reserves Department

State Statistical Office

Ms. Blagica Novkovska, Director
Ms. Verka Panova, Head, Sector of National Accounts
Ms. Tatjana Mitevska, Head, Department of International Cooperation and European Integration
Mr. Gordana Lazarova, Advisor for CPI
Mr. Stase Nolev, Head, the Department for Living Standard
Dr. Bernd Richter, Resident Twinning Adviser, EU representative

Ministry of Finance

Ms. Suzana Peneva, State Adviser
Ms. Liljana Gjurovska, State Advisor for Treasury
Mr. Dejan Nikolovski, Head, International Financial Relations and Public Debt Management Department
Ms. Mara Srezovska, Head, Department, Treasury Department
Ms. Biljana Janevska, Head, Fiscal Statistics and Analysis Division

University American College, School of Business Administration

Mr. Marjan Petreski, Vice-Dean of Research and Scientific Cooperation

Appendix II. Number of Participants from FYRM in STA Courses

Calendar Years 2000–2012

Program		Total	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012
IMF Institute (ICD) [1]	Vienna, Austria [3]	36	3	2	3	4	4	2	3	2	3	1	3	3	3
	Washington, D.C., USA	14	1	1	0	1	0	2	2	3	0	1	0	2	1
Outside INS Program [2][4]		3	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	1	0	0	1
Total		53	4	3	3	5	4	4	5	5	4	3	3	5	5

Source: PATS System, IMF Institute, retrieved through TAIMS. Run Date: January 14, 2013

1 Refers to training delivered by the IMF Institute or with its financial, teaching, or administrative support.

2 Refers to courses delivered by STA in venues other than IMF headquarters and Regional Training Centers.
3 Joint Vienna Institute.
4 The IMF did not track country-specific participant information for courses outside the IMF Institute program, until 2008.

Appendix III. Participants in IMF Statistics Course [2]

Course	Total	Year 2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012
Balance of Payments and International Investment Position Statistics	14	2	1		2			2		2	1	1	2	1
External Debt Statistics	7			1		1	1		2				1	1
Coordinated Direct Investment Survey	2										1			1
Financial Soundness Indicators	2				1							1		
Government Finance Statistics	5		1					1	1		1			1
Linkages between the Government Finance Statistics Manual and the System of National Accounts	2												2	
Monetary and Financial Statistics	12	1	1	1	1	1	2	1	2	1		1		
Monetary and Financial Statistics: Compilation and Reporting Issues	2					2								
National Accounts Statistics	2	1												1
Price Statistics	3			1			1	1						
Quarterly National Accounts Statistics	1				1									
Remittances Statistics	1										1			
Grand Total	53	4	3	3	5	4	4	5	5	4	3	3	5	5

Source: PATS System, IMF Institute (Run through the Course and Participant Interface). Run Date: January 14, 2013.

2 The IMF Institute did not track courses outside of INS until 2001

Appendix IV. QUESTIONNAIRE: Recipients of Technical Assistance

Technical Assistance Evaluation Mission

IMF's Statistics Department
September 2012

Objective: This questionnaire is intended to collect views of **key beneficiaries of technical assistance** regarding improvement of quality of macroeconomic statistics. The information would help the assessment of technical assistance (TA) provided by IMF's Statistics Department (STA) to various statistical agencies, if needed. The STA TA for macroeconomic statistics covers: national accounts, price statistics, government finance statistics, monetary and financial statistics, and external sector statistics. In addition to the Survey, the IMF STA mission will also conduct meetings with key stakeholders to help our understanding in depth on the modality of TA suitable to Macedonia.

Kindly accept our sincere appreciation for your cooperation in advance.
THANK YOU.

I. YOUR CONTACT INFORMATION AND BACKGROUND ANNEXES

1. Responsible Agency:

_____

2. Name of Official Completing the Questionnaire:

_____

3. Title/designation:

_____

4. Please see the attached list of technical assistance missions by the Statistics Department (STA) of the International Monetary Fund (IMF) to Macedonia (Annex I) and the tables summarizing the participation of Macedonia authorities in statistics-related courses sponsored by the IMF (Annex II).

II. EXPERIENCES WITH TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

5.   How would you describe the overall usefulness of technical assistance missions from the IMF's Statistics Department to Macedonia in: □ **national accounts,** □ **consumer price index (CPI) and/or Producer price index (PPI)**, □ **government finance statistics (GFS)**, □ **monetary and financial statistics (MFS)**, □ **external sector statistics**? (Check the area or areas that are relevant and check one of the options below.)

	National Accounts	Consumer and Producer Price Indices	Government Finance Statistics	Monetary and Financial Statistics	External Sector Statistics
Very useful					
Mostly useful					
Somewhat useful					
Hardly useful					

6.   What is your assessment of the **data quality improvement** in the different areas of statistics **between 2000 and 2005**? (Check the area or areas that are relevant to your data needs.)

	National Accounts	Consumer and Producer Price Indices	Government Finance Statistics	Monetary and Financial Statistics	External Sector Statistics
Very good					
Good					
Moderate					
Poor					

7.   (a) What is your assessment of **the quality improvement** made in the different areas of statistics **since 2006** that you may have observed? (Check the area or areas that are relevant and check one of the options below.)

	National Accounts	Consumer and Producer Price Indices	Government Finance Statistics	Monetary and Financial Statistics	External Sector Statistics
Very good					
Good					
Moderate					
Poor/hardly change					

(b) How would you assess the value of participation in IMF training in statistics?
(Check one.)

Very useful	_____
Mostly useful	_____
Somewhat useful	_____
Hardly useful	_____

8.   Please provide your views on the following aspects of the technical assistance in this area of statistics:

	Strongly Agree	Agree	Neutral	Disagree	Comments (Please use additional page if needed)
Areas of technical assistance work responded to your priority need.					
Recommendations of the mission(s) and time frame for implementation (e.g., Action Plan) were discussed and agreed with the authorities.					
The structure, length, and content of mission reports are appropriate for your needs.					
Technical assistance mission(s) provided applied, hands-on training in areas being addressed.					
Technical assistance facilitated your country's participation in GDDS or subscription to SDDS.					
Technical assistance facilitated your policy analysis, formulation, and monitoring.					
Technical assistance facilitated the dissemination (publication) of more and better quality statistics.					
Technical assistance resulted in improved data dissemination practices.					
Technical assistance facilitated regular data provision to IMF Western Hemisphere Department.					
Technical assistance facilitated regular data provision for publication in *IFS* and other IMF publications.					
Technical assistance facilitated national authorities' coordination and interaction with other donors.					

9.   Rank the delivery mode(s) that was (or were) relatively most effective in meeting technical assistance needs from 1 to 4, with 1 being the most effective and 4 being the least effective:

Short (two week) mission/visit	_____
Training/workshops (HQ and Regional Centers)	_____
Resident expert	_____
Other (please specify)	_____

10. If you are aware of STA's recommendations to improve the quality of statistics, how relevant have you found the recommendations of TA missions. If possible, identify by subject matter e.g. national accounts, price, GFS, MFS, and/or external sector statistics.

Very relevant   _____
Mostly relevant   _____
Somewhat relevant   _____
Hardly relevant   _____

11. What has been the degree of implementation of most relevant TA recommendations? If possible, identify by subject matter e.g. national accounts, price, GFS, MFS, and/or external sector statistics.

All of them   _____
More than half   _____
Less than half   _____
No recommendations implemented   _____

12. What are the reasons for the lack of implementation of TA recommendations? If possible, identify by subject matter e.g. national accounts, price, GFS, MFS, and/or external sector statistics.

Lack of resources   _____
Lack of source data   _____
Management decision (low priority, policy issues, etc.) Please explain.

13. How do you assess the impact of the implementation of TA recommendations on the country's statistical outputs? If possible, identify by subject matter e.g. national accounts, price, GFS, MFS, and/or external sector statistics.

Very good   _____
Good   _____
Moderate   _____
No impact at all   _____

Part III. ADDITIONAL COMMENTS

14.   If further technical assistance is needed, what are the goals to be achieved by future technical assistance?

15.   What criteria would you suggest to be used to assess progress toward the stated goals?

16.   How will future technical assistance contribute to achieving the stated goals?

Appendix V. QUESTIONNAIRE: Key Users of Data/Statistics

Technical Assistance Evaluation Mission

IMF's Statistics Department
September 2012

Objective: This questionnaire is intended to collect views of **key users of data/statistics** regarding improvement of quality of macroeconomic statistics. The information would help the assessment of technical assistance (TA) provided by IMF's Statistics Department (STA) to various statistical agencies, if needed. The STA TA for macroeconomic statistics covers: national accounts, price statistics, government finance statistics, monetary and financial statistics, and external sector statistics. In addition to the Survey, the IMF STA mission will also conduct meetings with key stakeholders to help our understanding in depth on the modality of TA suitable to Macedonia.

Kindly accept our sincere appreciation for your cooperation in advance.
THANK YOU.

I. YOUR CONTACT INFORMATION AND BACKGROUND ANNEXES

1. Agency/Entity name:

_____

2. Name of Official Completing the Questionnaire:

_____

3. Title/designation:

_____

4. Please see the attached list of technical assistance missions by the Statistics Department (STA) of the International Monetary Fund (IMF) to Macedonia (Annex I).

II. IMPROVEMENT OF DATA QUALITY AND TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

5.   If you are aware of the technical assistance missions from the IMF's Statistics Department to Macedonia, how would you describe the overall usefulness in: □ **national accounts,** □ **consumer price index (CPI) and/or Producer price index (PPI)**, □ **government finance statistics (GFS)**, □ **monetary and financial statistics (MFS)**, □ **external sector statistics**? (Check the area or areas that are relevant and check one of the options below)

	National Accounts	Consumer and Producer Price Indices	Government Finance Statistics	Monetary and Financial Statistics	External Sector Statistics
Very useful					
Mostly useful					
Somewhat useful					
Hardly useful					

6.   What is your assessment of the **data quality improvement** in the different areas of statistics **between 2000 and 2005**? (Check the area or areas that are relevant to your data needs.)

	National Accounts	Consumer and Producer Price Indices	Government Finance Statistics	Monetary and Financial Statistics	External Sector Statistics
Very good					
Good					
Moderate					
Poor					

7.   (a) What is your assessment of **the quality improvement** made in the different areas of statistics **since 2006** that you may have observed? (Check the area or areas that are relevant and check one of the options below)

	National Accounts	Consumer and Producer Price Indices	Government Finance Statistics	Monetary and Financial Statistics	External Sector Statistics
Very good					
Good					
Moderate					
Poor/hardly change					

(b) What is your assessment of the relevance of the different issues provided by IMF TA experts with your institution that relate to the data improvements in the different areas during TA missions? If you are not aware of the TA work, skip to the next question.

	National Accounts	Consumer and Producer Price Indices	Government Finance Statistics	Monetary and Financial Statistics	External Sector Statistics
Very relevant					
Mostly relevant					
Somewhat relevant					
Hardly relevant					

8.   Please provide your views on the following aspects of the technical assistance in this area of statistics:

	Strongly Agree	Agree	Neutral	Disagree	Comments (Please use additional page if needed)
Areas of technical assistance work that you are aware of responded to your priority need.					
Technical assistance provided that you are aware of resulted in data quality improvements that facilitated your policy analysis, formulation, and monitoring.					
Technical assistance provided that you are aware of facilitated the dissemination (publication) of more and better quality statistics.					
Technical assistance provided that you are aware of resulted in improved data dissemination practices.					
Technical assistance provided that you are aware of facilitated national authorities' coordination and interaction with donors and other stakeholders.					

9.   In what areas of statistics do you think improvement is required? (Please indicate any specific issues that need to be considered)

10.   What do you think were the main results of the technical assistance program between 1993 and 2002?

11.   What do you think were the main results of the technical assistance program since 2003?

12.   What were the most valuable results from IMF training in statistics?

Appendix VI. QUESTIONNAIRE: Consolidated Responses of TA Recipients and Key Data Users

Experiences and Improvement of Data Quality and Technical Assistance

1.   How would you describe the overall usefulness of technical assistance missions from the IMF's Statistics Department to Macedonia?

	Percentage	National Accounts	Consumer and Producer Price Indexes	Government Finance Statistics	Monetary and Financial Statistics	External Sector Statistics
Very useful	43.2%	8.6%	6.2%	3.7%	9.9%	14.8%
Mostly useful	44.4%	12.3%	9.9%	8.6%	6.2%	7.4%
Somewhat useful	8.6%	1.2%	0.0%	3.7%	2.5%	1.2%
Hardly useful	3.7%	0.0%	0.0%	3.7%	0.0%	0.0%
Total	100% (81 responses)	22.2%	16.0%	19.8%	18.5%	23.5%

2.   What is your assessment of the data quality improvement in the different areas of statistics between 2000 and 2005?

	Percentage	National Accounts	Consumer and Producer Price Indexes	Government Finance Statistics	Monetary and Financial Statistics	External Sector Statistics
Very good	9.3%	1.2%	1.2%	0.0%	1.2%	5.8%
Good	52.3%	12.8%	11.6%	10.5%	8.1%	9.3%
Moderate	31.4%	5.8%	3.5%	4.7%	10.5%	7.0%
Poor	7.0%	2.3%	0.0%	4.7%	0.0%	0.0%
Total	100% (86 responses)	22.1%	16.3%	19.8%	19.8%	22.1%

3.   What is your assessment of the quality improvement made in the different areas of statistics since 2006 that you may have observed?

	Percentage	National Accounts	Consumer and Producer Price Indexes	Government Finance Statistics	Monetary and Financial Statistics	External Sector Statistics
Very good	25.0%	1.0%	2.1%	2.1%	8.3%	11.5%
Good	57.3%	16.7%	11.5%	7.3%	11.5%	10.4%
Moderate	13.5%	3.1%	4.2%	6.3%	0.0%	0.0%
Poor	4.2%	0.0%	0.0%	4.2%	0.0%	0.0%
Total	100% (96 responses)	20.8%	17.7%	19.8%	19.8%	21.9%

4.   What is your assessment of the relevance of the different issues provided by IMF TA experts with your institution that relate to the data improvements in the different areas during TA missions?
[Key Users Only]

		National Accounts	Consumer and Producer Price Indexes	Government Finance Statistics	Monetary and Financial Statistics	External Sector Statistics
Very relevant	53.8%	15.4%	0.0%	7.7%	15.4%	15.4%
Mostly relevant	38.5%	7.7%	7.7%	7.7%	7.7%	7.7%
Somewhat relevant	7.7%	0.0%	0.0%	7.7%	0.0%	0.0%
Hardly relevant	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
Total	100% (13 responses)	23.1%	7.7%	23.1%	23.1%	23.1%

5.   Please provide your views on the following aspects of the technical assistance in this area of statistics. **[Key Users Only]**

	Strongly Agree	Agree	Neutral	Disagree
Areas of technical assistance work responded to your priority need	7.1%	12.9%	1.4%	0.0%
Technical assistance provided that you are aware of resulted in data quality improvements that facilitated your policy analysis, formulation, and monitoring	1.4%	12.9%	5.7%	0.0%

Technical assistance provided that you are aware of facilitated the dissemination (publication) of more and better quality statistics.	2.9%	5.7%	10.0%	0.0%
Technical assistance provided that you are aware of resulted in improved data dissemination practices	4.3%	7.1%	11.4%	0.0%
Technical assistance provided that you are aware of facilitated national authorities' coordination and interaction with donors and other stakeholders.	2.9%	2.9%	11.4%	0.0%
Total (100% represents 70 responses.)	18.6%	41.4%	40.0%	0.0%

6.   **[TA Recipients - Only]**

	Strongly Agree	Agree	Neutral	Disagree
Areas of technical assistance work responded to your priority need	6.8%	2.7%	0.0%	0.0%
Recommendations of the mission(s) and time frame for implementation (e.g., Action Plan) were discussed and agreed with the authorities	2.7%	6.8%	0.0%	0.0%
The structure, length, and content of mission reports are appropriate for your needs	2.7%	6.8%	0.0%	0.0%
Technical assistance mission(s) provided applied, hands-on training in areas being address	2.7%	5.5%	0.0%	0.0%
Technical assistance facilitated your country's participation in GDDS or subscription to SDDS.	5.5%	4.1%	0.0%	0.0%
Technical assistance facilitated your policy analysis, formulation, and monitoring.	2.7%	5.5%	1.4%	0.0%
Technical assistance facilitated the dissemination (publication) of more and better quality statistics.	5.5%	4.1%	0.0%	0.0%
Technical assistance resulted in improved data dissemination practices.	1.4%	8.2%	0.0%	0.0%
Technical assistance facilitated regular data provision to IMF Western Hemisphere Department.	1.4%	5.5%	1.4%	0.0%
Technical assistance facilitated regular data provision for publication in *IFS* and other IMF publications.	1.4%	4.1%	2.7%	0.0%
Technical assistance facilitated national authorities' coordination and interaction with other donors.	1.4%	5.5%	1.4%	0.0%
Total (100% represents 73 responses.)				

7.   **Summarized response from Key Data User Only.**

In what areas of statistics do you think improvement is required? (Please indicate any specific issues that need to be considered.)

GDP, Growth rate and FDA analytics; labor statistics; Debt statistics (public, external, etc, fixed capital investment statistics, living standards statistics, private transfers statistics, timeliness and comprehensiveness of GFS, Real Estate Price statistics, Confidence Indicators, Statistics on Disposable Income, Financial accounts, Consolidated Budget data and user friendliness of the SSO web page.

8.   **Responses from TA Recipients only—Summary.**

a) Rank the delivery mode(s) that was (or were) relatively most effective in meeting technical assistance needs from 1 to 4, with 1 being the most effective and 4 being the least effective. Average scores of responses:

Short (two week) mission/visit	1.86
Training/workshops (HQ and Regional Centers)	2.0
Resident expert	2.0
Other (please specify)	3.5

b) If you are aware of STA's recommendations to improve the quality of statistics, how relevant have you found the recommendations of TA missions. If possible, identify by subject matter e.g. national accounts (NA), price, GFS, MFS, and/or external sector statistics (ES). Number of responses by subject:

Very relevant	ES = 2; MFS = 2
Mostly relevant	CPI = 1; NA = 2
Somewhat relevant	_____
Hardly relevant	_____

c) What has been the degree of implementation of most relevant TA recommendations? If possible, identify by subject matter e.g. national accounts (NA), price, GFS, MFS, and/or external sector statistics (ES). Number of responses by subject:

All of them	ES = 1; MFS = 1
More than half	CPI = 1; ES = 1; MFS = 1; NA = 2
Less than half	_____
No recommendations implemented	_____

d) What are the reasons for the lack of implementation of TA recommendations? If possible, identify by subject matter e.g. national accounts (NA), price, GFS, MFS, and/or external sector statistics (ES). Number of responses by subject:

Lack of resources	ES = 1; MFS = 1; NA = 2
Lack of source data	ES = 1; MFS = 1; NA = 2
Management decision (low priority, policy issues, etc.) Please explain.	

9.   How do you assess the impact of the implementation of TA recommendations on the country's statistical outputs? If possible, identify by subject matter e.g. national accounts (NA), price, GFS, MFS, and/or external sector statistics (ES). Number of responses by subject:

Very good   ES = 2; MFS = 2; NA = 1
Good   CPI = 1; NA = 1
Moderate   _____
No impact at all   _____

ADDITIONAL COMMENTS
[TA Recipients Only – summarized response]

If further technical assistance is needed, what are the goals to be achieved by future technical assistance?

- Establishing the security by security database, flow statistics for the MFS, confirmation of the already established Other Financial Corporations' Statistics, technical assistance in the form of training/workshops organized either at the IMF Headquarters, or at the Regional JVI centre and implementation of export/import real price index.

What criteria would you suggest to be used to assess progress toward the stated goals?

- Improvement of quality in statistics, more comprehensive data, implementation of international standards, data quality checks and data dissemination, adjustment of the current BOP methodology towards BPM 6 and conversion of all items to the new BOP standard presentation tables; further alignment with international standard, and with EU statistical requirements; published indices on regular basis.

How will future technical assistance contribute to achieving the stated goals?

- Through improved compilation methodology, suitable data sources, sharing of practical experiences in implementation of macroeconomic statistics compilation standards, and additional training.

What do you think were the main results of the technical assistance program prior to 2002 (2000-2002)?

- Improved quality of statistics and adherence to international standards through adoption of suitable methodologies and more reliable source data.

What do you think were the main results of the technical assistance program since 2003?

- Compilation and publication of an IIP, compilation of MFS as per the MFS Manual and Guide, improvement of quarterly GDP statistics, and compilation of Export/Import Price Index statistics(unit value index).

What were the most valuable results from IMF training in statistics?

- Improvements of data sources and data quality; gaining knowledge of the new standards and recommendations according to the international manuals, and knowledge on the implementation of the Guides and Manuals on statistics.

Appendix VII. QUESTIONNAIRE: Consolidated Responses of TA Recipients

Technical Assistance Evaluation Mission

IMF's Statistics Department
September 2012

Experiences with Technical Assistance

How would you describe the overall usefulness of technical assistance missions from the IMF's Statistics Department to Macedonia?

	Total	National Accounts	Consumer and Producer Price Indexes	Government Finance Statistics	Monetary and Financial Statistics	External Sector Statistics
Very useful	77.8%	11.1%	0.0%	0.0%	33.3%	33.3%
Mostly useful	22.2%	11.1%	11.1%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
Somewhat useful	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
Hardly useful	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
Total	100% (9 responses)					

What is your assessment of the **data quality improvement** in the different areas of statistics between 2000 and 2005?

	Total	National Accounts	Consumer and Producer Price Indexes	Government Finance Statistics	Monetary and Financial Statistics	External Sector Statistics
Very good	37.5%	0.0%	12.5%	0.0%	0.0%	25.0%
Good	37.5%	25.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	12.5%
Moderate	25.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	25.0%	0.0%
Poor	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
Total	100% (8 responses)					

a) What is your assessment of the quality improvement made in the different areas of statistics since 2006 that you may have observed?

	Total	National Accounts	Consumer and Producer Price Indexes	Government Finance Statistics	Monetary and Financial Statistics	External Sector Statistics
Very good	62.5%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	25.0%	37.5%
Good	37.5%	25.0%	12.5%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
Moderate	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
Total	100% (8 responses)					

b) How would you assess the value of participation in IMF training in Statistics?

Very useful	6
Mostly useful	1
Somewhat useful	_____
Hardly useful	_____

8.   Please provide your views on the following aspects of the technical assistance in this area of statistics:

	Strongly Agree	Agree	Neutral	Disagree
Areas of technical assistance work responded to your priority need.	6.8%	2.7%	0.0%	0.0%
Recommendations of the mission(s) and time frame for implementation (e.g., Action Plan) were discussed and agreed with the authorities.	2.7%	6.8%	0.0%	0.0%
The structure, length, and content of mission reports are appropriate for your needs.	2.7%	6.8%	0.0%	0.0%
Technical assistance mission(s) provided applied, hands-on training in areas being address.	2.7%	5.5%	0.0%	0.0%
Technical assistance facilitated your country's participation in GDDS or subscription to SDDS.	5.5%	4.1%	0.0%	0.0%
Technical assistance facilitated your policy analysis, formulation, and monitoring.	2.7%	5.5%	1.4%	0.0%
Technical assistance facilitated the dissemination (publication) of more and better quality statistics.	5.5%	4.1%	0.0%	0.0%
Technical assistance resulted in improved data dissemination practices.	1.4%	8.2%	0.0%	0.0%
Technical assistance facilitated regular data provision to IMF Western Hemisphere Department.	1.4%	5.5%	1.4%	0.0%

Technical assistance facilitated regular data provision for publication in *IFS* and other IMF publications.	1.4%	4.1%	2.7%	0.0%
Technical assistance facilitated national authorities' coordination and interaction with other donors.	1.4%	5.5%	1.4%	0.0%
Total 100% represents 73 responses.				

9. Rank the delivery mode(s) that was (or were) relatively most effective in meeting technical assistance needs from 1 to 4, with 1 being the most effective and 4 being the least effective. Average scores of responses:

    Short (two week) mission/visit   1.86
    Training/workshops
    (HQ and Regional Centers)   2.0
    Resident expert   2.0
    Other (please specify)   3.5

10. If you are aware of STA's recommendations to improve the quality of statistics, how relevant have you found the recommendations of TA missions. If possible, identify by subject matter e.g. national accounts (NA), price, GFS, MFS, and/or external sector statistics (ES). Number of responses by subject:

    Very relevant   ES = 2; MFS= 2
    Mostly relevant   CPI = 1; NA = 2
    Somewhat relevant   _____
    Hardly relevant   _____

11. What has been the degree of implementation of most relevant TA recommendations? If possible, identify by subject matter e.g. national accounts (NA), price, GFS, MFS, and/or external sector statistics (ES). Number of responses by subject:

    All of them   ES = 1; MFS = 1
    More than half   CPI = 1; ES = 1; MFS = 1; NA = 2
    Less than half   _____
    No recommendations implemented   _____

12. What are the reasons for the lack of implementation of TA recommendations? If possible, identify by subject matter e.g. national accounts (NA), price, GFS, MFS, and/or external sector statistics (ES). Number of responses by subject:

    Lack of resources   ES = 1; MFS = 1; NA = 2
    Lack of source data   ES = 1; MFS = 1; NA = 2
    Management decision (low priority, policy issues, etc.) Please explain.

13. How do you assess the impact of the implementation of TA recommendations on the country's statistical outputs? If possible, identify by subject matter e.g. national accounts (NA), price, GFS, MFS, and/or external sector statistics (ES). Number of responses by subject:

Very good	ES = 2; MFS = 2; NA = 1
Good	CPI = 1; NA = 1
Moderate	_____
No impact at all	_____

Appendix VIII. QUESTIONNAIRE: Consolidated Responses of Key Data Users

Technical Assistance Evaluation Mission

IMF's Statistics Department
September 2012

Improvement of Data Quality and Technical Assistance

1. If you are aware of the technical assistance missions from the IMF's Statistics Department to Macedonia, how would you describe the overall usefulness?

	Total	National Accounts	Consumer and Producer Price Indexes	Government Finance Statistics	Monetary and Financial Statistics	External Sector Statistics
Very useful	38.9%	8.3%	6.9%	4.2%	6.9%	12.5%
Mostly useful	47.2%	12.5%	9.7%	9.7%	6.9%	8.3%
Somewhat useful	9.7%	1.4%	0.0%	4.2%	2.8%	1.4%
Hardly useful	4.2%	0.0%	0.0%	4.2%	0.0%	0.0%
Total	100% (72 responses)					

2. What is your assessment of the **data quality improvement** in the different areas of statistics between 2000 and 2005?

	Total	National Accounts	Consumer and Producer Price Indexes	Government Finance Statistics	Monetary and Financial Statistics	External Sector Statistics
Very good	6.4%	1.3%	0.0%	0.0%	1.3%	3.8%
Good	53.8%	11.5%	12.8%	11.5%	9.0%	9.0%
Moderate	32.1%	6.4%	3.8%	5.1%	9.0%	7.7%
Poor	7.7%	2.6%	0.0%	5.1%	0.0%	0.0%
Total	100% (78 responses)					

3. a) What is your assessment of **the quality improvement** made in the different areas of statistics since 2006 that you may have observed?

	Total	National Accounts	Consumer and Producer Price Indexes	Government Finance Statistics	Monetary and Financial Statistics	External Sector Statistics
Very good	21.6%	1.1%	2.3%	2.3%	6.8%	9.1%
Good	59.1%	15.9%	11.4%	8.0%	12.5%	11.4%
Moderate	14.8%	3.4%	4.5%	6.8%	0.0%	0.0%
Poor/hardly change	4.5%	0.0%	0.0%	4.5%	0.0%	0.0%
Total	100% (88 responses)					

b) What is your assessment of the relevance of the different issues provided by IMF TA experts with your institution that relate to the data improvements in the different areas during TA missions? If you are not aware of the TA work, skip to the next questions.

	Total	National Accounts	Consumer and Producer Price Indexes	Government Finance Statistics	Monetary and Financial Statistics	External Sector Statistics
Very relevant	53.8%	15.4%	0.0%	7.7%	15.4%	15.4%
Mostly relevant	38.5%	7.7%	7.7%	7.7%	7.7%	7.7%
Somewhat relevant	7.7%	0.0%	0.0%	7.7%	0.0%	0.0%
Hardly relevant	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
Total	100% (13 responses)					

4. Please provide your views on the following aspects of the technical assistance in this area of statistics:

	Strongly Agree	Agree	Neutral	Disagree
Areas of technical assistance work responded to your priority need	7.1%	12.9%	1.4%	0.0%
Technical assistance provided that you are aware of resulted in data quality improvements that facilitated your policy analysis, formulation, and monitoring.	1.4%	12.9%	5.7%	0.0%
Technical assistance provided that you are aware of facilitated the dissemination (publication) of more and better quality statistics.	2.9%	5.7%	10.0%	0.0%
Technical assistance provided that you are aware of resulted in improved data dissemination practices.	4.3%	7.1%	11.4%	0.0%
Technical assistance provided that you are aware of facilitated national authorities' coordination and interaction with donors and other stakeholders.	2.9%	2.9%	11.4%	0.0%
Total 100% represents 70 responses.				